Hiring Practices Effect on Project team Monitoring. Bureaucratic Theory at the Public Sector

Dr. HASAN ODEH ABDEL MUHSIN ABU DAHER

1. Abstract

Hiring practices are vital for any organization because they have consequences for its success and goals meeting, and it has a significant effect on many other organizational variables as literature shows. On the other hand, project team management practices are very important to any Civil Services Sector (CSS) because they affect projects success that consumes big resources of a nation treasury and can affect citizens' life as literature confirmed. This research aims to examine the influence of hiring practices of Palestinian CSS on project team management practices. This research is designed as quantitative study that uses correlational design. A questionnaire was designed to meet the need for collecting primary data from the community. The tool was conducted through google forms to ensure proper timing of responses and proper collection for data. Moreover, the SPSS program and the Smart PLS Version 4 were used to analyze the data and to confirm research tool reliability and validity. The population was the supervisory-positions employees who work at Ministry Of Education of Palestine (MoE) with total number of 644. A sample of 341 was selected randomly at a confidence level of (0.05). The response rate was 95.9 %. Findings indicated that employment policies implementation and recruitment practices can affect project team monitoring practices. Where no significant effect was found of selection practices on project team monitoring practices. To sum up, improving hiring practices will lead to better project team monitoring practice. This study is very important for CCS leaders, human resources managers, project managers, and policy makers. Increasing project team management efficiency will help Palestinian for better utilization of the scarce resources and will increase the CSS project goals meeting.

2. Introduction

Organizations are not walls and offices, they are the people who manage them and the level of quality of people it acquire. Human resources are essential element of any modern organization's success for many reasons: they control and run all other resources, they create intellectual property for the organization which differentiates successful organizations from those that cannot survive, and they manage the relations with customers, service receivers, partners, stakeholders and/or competitors. Consequently, Hiring practice becomes one of the most important practices that is vital for the success and survival of any organization in the competitive and rabid changing contexts worldwide. On the other hand, public projects are a very important tool for any country. Where project monitoring practices play a major factor that affects any project success as confirmed by literature. It links public project outcomes with the ability to provide traceability, transparency, and accountability. Therefore, it seems that this practice in addition to hiring practices are very crucial for public organization success.

3. Background

Public organization success is vital in Palestine for many reasons that comes from the challenging situation caused by occupation. The resources are limited and scarce (Awad, 2016). Palestinians do not fully control them because of the occupation who causes a unique case for public administration in Palestine (Sulaimani, 2019). Hence, human factor becomes the only means to have solid foundations for the Palestinian state (Al-Jabari, 2013). Consequently, the solution is to have efficient HRM practices for the public sector (Awad, 2016) and Hiring is a vital one of them. Nevertheless, hiring practices of Palestinian public sector are not at the expected level where the limitation of HRM practices makes it closer to personnel affairs (Al-Sharbati, 2017). In addition,

hiring suffers from the absence of workforce planning, weak linkage between hiring and actual needs, and moderate effort that is spent on hiring policies and hiring priorities (Obeid, 2017). Furthermore, favoritism and nepotism cause more cost of hiring practice (Al-Ghazali, 2016). Also, patrimonial makes the system suffer from overstaffing (Al-Sabbah. et al., 2017). Consequently, hiring practices created a high salaries' percentage in comparison with other expenditures (Sulaimani, 2019). As an indicator, citizens believe that hiring is the most common service in which corruption has spread in the public sector (Coalition for Accountability and Integrity, 2018). Accordingly, it is noticeably clear from those studies that hiring practices are not at the expected level in Palestinian CSS.

The scarce resources are consumed through public projects which are in need to be implemented efficiently and effectively. Nevertheless, Palestine public projects had a limited contribution to the process of change and sustainable development in the Palestinian society (Qashue, 2018). Where training public projects do not meet the expected results and goals despite millions of dollars that were spent on them (General personnel council, 2017). In addition, road projects suffer from a very low rate of implementation against plans (Issa and Abu-Eisheh, 2017). More and more, and according to the director of planning unit at MoE. projects at MoE meet around 50% of their goals, (especially financial goals) as an average for the past ten years.

This Paper is trying to find a link between hiring practices and project monitoring practices in the Palestinian context. Since project monitoring practices has a significant role of any project success and the scarce resources of Palestinian public sector. It spend a valuable portion of the budget on these public projects. Therfore, studying hiring

practices effect on project monitoring practices can help to enhance both practices to get better results and meets more goals for the public projects.

3.1. Hiring Practices Concept

Hiring practices are major activities of HRM according to previous researches, such as: (Al-Qaralah, 2018; Bothaljieh and Husaini, 2018; Kaushal, 2017; Al-Sharbati, 2017; Verma, 2016; Yaza, 2016; Lebow, 2014). Abdul-Qadir and Jaafar (2020) defined hiring as all practices to fill vacancies. This includes two types of employment: External and internal (Yaza, 2016). Al-Ghazali (2016) defined it as a pool of candidates that is generated to apply for employment to an organization, and the use of specific instruments and criteria to choose persons who are more likely to succeed in the job. Furthermore, Hiring is a very crucial practice for any organization (Dessler, 2017), because it is a critical factor for organizational survival and success (Collins and Kehoe ,2009). Therefore, hiring importance comes from the dependency of an organization success on the quality of its human resources (Al-Sawsaa, 2018). Lastly, hiring practices consist of two main practices: recruitment and selection (Al-Qaralah, 2018; Dessler, 2017; Al-Ghazali, 2016). Recruitment practices which are the process for which an organization seeks applicants and attracts potential employees (Al-Naqbi, 2011). Where the selection practices are the process of assessing candidates to ensure that the most appropriate ones are hired (Oluoch, 2013). Furthermore, Bureaucratic theory is one of the famous theories that have been applied in the public sector because this theory is incredibly useful for managing large-scale organizations (Egyankosh, 2017) and it suits the public sector because it defines every single unit of effort, which is divided into the completion of duties that are handled to officials (Hollyer, 2011). Where hiring is a main component of bureaucratic theory (Serpa and Ferreira, 2019). Hiring in this theory

6

must be framed by employment policies implementation according to its literature (Collins and Kehoe, 2008; McNeill, 2022; Egyankosh, 2017; Serpa and Ferreira, 2019; Visitchaichan, 2004; Baron et al., 2001). Employment Policies can be defined as all formal policies and procedures that ensure all employees become experts regarding their jobs (Collins and Kehoe, 2008). This add another variable to the hiring practices which is the Employment Policies Implementation in the Bureaucratic Theory. However, Hiring practices can affect many organization variables according to the literature. However, very few studies were found about public sector hiring in Palestine after deep search. Studies are very scarce that link hiring to performance of public employees in Palestine (Abdul-Qadir and Jaafar, 2020). Hamayel (2018) found that hiring practices have an effect on the existence of administrative problems. Verma (2016) noticed that hiring can affect employee satisfaction. Where Yaza (2016) noticed the same result, and the same result was mentioned by Lebow (2014). While Ion Chitescu and Lixandru (2015) found that hiring practices can affect motivation and they are related to work stress. However, Obeid (2017) mentioned that employment policy can affect all other hiring practices. More and more, recruitment practices can affect many aspects of project team management and project monitoring is one practice of it. Al-Qaralah (2018) study results showed that the quality of recruitment influences the level of organizational commitment. Moreover, Nadarajah et al. (2012) found that selective hiring practices can affect job performance and career development.

Six main employment policies must be implemented to govern hiring practices after reviewing the bureaucratic theory literature: Work force planning policy (hiring should be governed by clear workforce characteristics (Collins and Kehoe, 2008)), Well-defined tasks policy (every job is based on well-defined tasks (Baron et al., 2001)), Job descriptions (that outline the responsibilities of a position by listing the tasks to be

completed and the skills required to do so (McNeill, 2022)), Written procedures (written documents are the base of all hiring activities for bureaucratic theory (Egyankosh, 2017) where administrators are subjected to strict rules, discipline, and controls regarding the conduct of their official duties (Visitchaichan, 2004)), Values frame and cultural fit (all hiring procedures must be aligned with organizational culture, which makes hiring practices serve the values frame and cultural fit (Collins and Kehoe, 2008)), Centralized hiring processes policy (with centralized processes, the ability to follow rules and procedures must be considered in selection decisions (Visitchaichan, 2004)), and lastly long-term employment policy (every job is based on long-term employment conditions (Baron et al., 2001)).

Recruitment is a process to search for and explore persons with competencies to occupy current or planned jobs in modern scientific methods and means, and to carry out an analysis and classification of jobs in the organization to determine needs and conditions to be met by the incumbent (Abdul-Qadir and Jaafar, 2020). This sub practice has four main activities according to bureaucratic theory: wide labor targeting and sourcing (Decenzo et al., 2010; Dessler, 2017), recruiting on competencies base (Welasari et al., 2021; Joostensz et al., 2015; Hollyer, 2011), recruiting on experiences-basis (Welasari et al., 2021; Visitchaichan, 2004), and directly-job successors Recruiting (Visitchaichan, 2004), It takes 12 weeks for a newly hired person to become fully productive at work on average (Boskamp, 2022). Selection in Bureaucratic Theory

Selection is a process to choose among candidates depending on their skills, knowledge, behaviors, and other competencies (Dessler, 2017). Selection as sub-practice has five main activities: selection on skills-basis (McNeill, 2022; Oluoch, 2013; Visitchaichan, 2004), selection on experiences-basis (Welasari. et al., 2021), Formal

examinations for selection**,** (Welasari et al., 2021, Visitchaichan, 2004), and Quick selection processes (Visitchaichan, 2004; Baron et al., 2001, Inexpensive selection processes (Chamberlain, 2017; Baron et al., 2001). The figure 3-1 was developed by the researcher for the use of this study as shown below.

Figure 3-1: Bureaucratic Hiring Model

3.2. Project Team Monitoring Practices

Most scholars consider that modern project management started with the innovative scheduling diagram "Gantt chart" by Henry Gantt in 1917 (Kalayathankal et al., 2021). Furthermore, project management was formally recognized as a distinct field in the late 1950s (Kissi et al., 2019). The improvement of project management came by setting more focus on risk management and quality management, which led to the new approach that is called "Iterative approach" (Dinsmore and Cabanis-brewin, 2010). The Iterative Approach of Project Management is a way of delivering projects results using very short rapid iterative development techniques (Kaczorowska, 2015). Moreover, in 1969, Project Management Institute (PMI) was established as a non-profit organization for project management in the USA that introduces project management in Iterative approach (Al-Muhaimid, 2017). PMI Iterative Approach is a set of standard guidelines that are widely accepted and consistently applied (Kamau, 2015). It is based on nine areas distributed throughout the project five lifecycle phases where project monitoring and control crosses over all phases (Project Management Institute, 2017). Furthermore,

PMI Iterative Approach is considered as the most famous project management approach in the world that has spread in Asia, Africa, and the USA, (Al-Muhaimid, 2017; Project Management Institute, 2017).

Project monitoring is the art of making a steering decision at the right time to improve project results, that is crucial to initiate positive results (Gudda, 2011). While project team monitoring is the process of ensuring that the team members are assigned and allocated for the project planned activities as well as monitoring the planned versus actual utilization of resources and taking corrective action as necessary (Project Management Institute, 2017). Project team monitoring according to PMI Iterative Approach has three sub practices: Firstly, monitoring of project team planning and acquisition (developing an acquiring plan for monitoring team, characteristics of the acquiring plan, cost of acquiring plan, timing of the acquiring plan, project phase of the monitoring project team acquiring, the project manager acquiring time, and competencies basis for project monitoring team selection. Secondly, monitoring of project team development and management that are related to: (project team expenditures, project team shortages in a timely manner, activities solutions for the project team shortages, acquiring plan, stakeholders involvement, and changes specification, changes effect. Thirdly, monitoring techniques for Team management that are related to: (data analysis for project team situation, detection of project team problems when they occur, finding suitable solutions for project team problems, negotiation with stakeholders and influencing them to deal with project team issues, and using of project management information system.

3.3. Hiring and Project team Monitoring Practices

Hiring with all its sub practices is expected to affect project monitoring according to literature. Homayounfarda and Safakishb (2016) said that project team planning - as work force planning policy is the first principle of hiring policies implementation- can affect project monitoring planning. Project Management Institute (2017) confirm the relation between project monitoring and project team planning. Where Ali et al. (2021) study results showed that project monitoring can be affected by political hiring. Nekvapilova and Pitas (2016) indicated that the biggest problem threatening the success of a project is human resources. Gudda, P (2011) showed that monitoring strategies depend on many factors and staffing strategies and the sustainability that is given to human and financial resources. Ali et al. (2021) showed that project monitoring can be affected by a shortage of skilled labor, he claimed that project monitoring can be more prone if the monitoring staff is less experienced and not equipped with the required skills. Moreover, Jahaf (2021) found that it is the necessity to have officials who are highly skilled in M&E (Monitoring and Evaluation) to ensure effective practice of M&E. In addition, Tache. F and Ispasoiu. C (2013) found that a proper emphasis must be placed in selecting the project team because it's chronic factors on the efficiency of the projects monitoring and evaluation processes, he found that the efficiency of the use of monitoring and evaluation tools and mechanisms can be affected by the lack of experience of the selected project team. Where Callistus and Clinton (2016) said that the number, the budget for staffing, and capacities of the selected project team can affect the success of any project monitoring plan. Antoniadis. D (2012) added that selecting team members is linked to monitor team performance because it is a very critical Project Management sub-process. More and more, Kamau (2015) indicated the need to set focus on the hiring of the project team because there is a linkage between the strength

of the project team and effectiveness of monitoring and evaluation. Therefore, a Qualified professionals should be put in charge of handling the project monitoring and control departments/units (Adebayo .O et al., 2018).

To sum up, hiring practices is expected to affect project monitoring practices in the Palestinian context of CSS. Therefore, the hypotheses are:

H1: Project monitoring practices are affected by employment policies implementation in the CSS of Palestine.

H2: Project monitoring practices are affected by recruitment practices in the CSS of Palestine.

H3: Project monitoring practices are affected by selection practices in the CSS of Palestine.

4. Methodology

4.1. Study's Approach and Design

The unit of analyses are the individuals who works as heads of middle management unit and high management level of MoE. The study is a quantitative study that uses a correlational design to test the hypotheses about the relations between study variables. Quantitative study is the process of collecting and analyzing numerical data. It can be used to find patterns and averages, make predictions, test causal relationships, and generalize results to wider populations (Bhandari, 2020). The quantitative approach is used for this study because of its nature and aim. It tries to test casual relations through collecting numerical data that is analyzed to make predictions. It started with reviewing literature that is related to study's variables. Then to develop the instrument for the study. Then information and data were collected, where it was collected through google

form because of the Palestinian situation and closers. Afterward, analysis was conducted of the gathered data and information to give interpretation of the relation between the variables. This study proposed a conceptual framework to describe the relation between hiring practices on one hand, and project monitoring practices on the other. The intent was to investigate the relationship between those variables of interest in this research.

4.2. Population and sample

The Palestinian Ministry of Education (MoE) is the largest ministry in the Civil Services Sector CSS. The employees are more than forty-seven thousand employees which rate around 57% of the Palestinian civil sector (PMoE, 2019), which make it a representative organization for the civil sector because of the size. In addition, MoE hired more than three thousand long-term employees and a greater number of short-term employees in the years 2019-2020, which makes it most of the civil sector hiring (General personnel council, 2021). Another reason to target MoE is the big portion of MoE budget that is spent on projects (Almost 40% of the total budget) annually, where more than 1.4 billion dollars have been allocated for its projects since 2012, and more than 200 million dollars were allocated to projects in the last two years according to the head of projects unit at MoE. Lastly, education portion consists more than 22% of the national budget annually (PMoF, 2019). Furthermore, Ministry of Education (MoE) staff form a portion of 57% of CSS. The study targeted the personnel who are mandated to be part of hiring processes and project management at MoE. They are only the one who occupy managerial levels at the ministry. They are in four managerial levels: general directors, administrative unit heads, department managers, and section heads. How ever, This population strata are not equal in volume, two of them are very small

strata (17 general directors and 5 heads of administrative unit out of 644 positions) in comparison to the other two strata. The total number of the targeted population according to MoE data is 644 according to the organizational structure diagram of the ministry. Table4.1 below shows the population distribution at the ministry.

Table 4-1: Population Distribution

Description of Unit (Strata)	Number of Unit heads
General Directors	17
Administrative unit heads	5
Department managers	143
Section heads	479
SUM	**644**

Accordingly, a disproportionate stratified sample was taken from the population at the confidence level of (0.05). According to Hiktner et al. (2007) in management research the typical levels of confidence used are 95 percent where Z value is equal to 1.96. The first two strata were taken completely because of their small number. A list of the population members was developed for each stratum, then a sequential number was given to each member. Lastly, https://www.random.org/ website was used to extract random numbers for each stratum to specify the required respondent. Where the next formula was applied to identify the representative sample, the formula retrieved from Creative Research System Portal:

n= [Z2 * p * (1 - p) / E2] / [1 + (Z2 * p * (1 - p) / (E2 * N))].

The total number of the sample is **341** employees where the ministry and its directorate in the districts were targeted to fill in the questionnaire. Table 4.2 below shows the sample distribution in the ministry after applying the above-mentioned formula.

Table 4-2: Sample Distribution

Unit description	Formula	Sample size
General Directors	$=17 * (1.96)^2 *0.5*(1-0.5)/ (0.05)^2/ (17 - 1+((1.96)^2 * 0.5*(1-0.5)/ (0.05)^2)))$	17
Administrative unit heads	$=5 * (1.96)^2 *0.5*(1-0.5)/ (0.05)^2/ (5 - 1+((1.96)^2 * 0.5*(1-0.5)/ (0.05)^2)))$	5
Department managers	$=143 * (1.96)^2 *0.5*(1-0.5)/ (0.05)^2/ (143 - 1+((1.96)^2 * 0.5*(1-0.5)/ (0.05)^2)))$	105
Section heads	$=479 * (1.96)^2 *0.5*(1-0.5)/ (0.05)^2/ (479 - 1+((1.96)^2 * 0.5*(1-0.5)/ (0.05)^2)))$	214
SUM		**341**

Moreover, 14 members of the sample didn't fill in the questionnaire for different reasons at the time of data collection. Consequently, the response rate was 95.9 %, where 327 respondents answered and returned the questionnaire (response rate is 327/341 = 95.9%) . In addition, the sample location was West Bank of Palestine, which is distributed among eighteen districts. Lastly, the instrument was sent through google forms to collect data from the random sample.

4.3. Instruments

A questionnaire was designed to meet the need of collecting perceptual information from the community. These collected data defined the relation between dependent and independent variables according to the research model. The type of data that was collected by this tool was quantitative data. The section and paragraphs of the questionnaire were adopted from previous scholars studies and researches. However, the questionnaire had the following sections:

i. First section: It was designed for the sake of this study to gather demographic information such as: gender, age, years of experience, educational level, field of study, field of current job, position, and training information. It includes eight questions which are all designed especially for this study.

ii. Second Section: It tackled the study's variables, and it gathered data in two dimensions:

1. Hiring practices according to bureaucratic theory: which has three sub practices. Each sub practice was given a dimension in the tool that are:
   a. Employment policies implementation that are related to:
      - Workforce planning.
      - Job description.
      - Written hiring procedure.
      - Organizational culture and values.
      - Centralized hiring processes.
      - Long-term employment.
   b. Recruitment practices that are related to:
      - Internal sources of recruitment.

- External sources of recruitment.

- Competencies base for recruitment.

- Experience base for recruitment.

- Employees success time after hiring.

c. Selection practices

- Skills base for selection activities.

- Experience base for selection activities.

- Formal examinations and/or interviews for selection.

- Time consuming for selection processes.

- Cost of selection processes.

- up team members and get feedback.

2. Project team monitoring according to PMI Iterative Approach: which has three sub practices. Each sub practice was given a dimension in the tool, they are:

a. Monitoring of project team planning and acquisition that are related to:

- Developing an acquiring plan for monitoring team.

- The characteristics of the acquiring plan.

- The cost of acquiring plan.

- The timing of the acquiring plan.

- The project phase of the monitoring project team acquiring.

- The project manager acquiring time.

- Competencies basis for project monitoring team selection

b. Monitoring of project team development and management that are related to:

- Project team expenditures (salaries, rewards ... etc.).

- Project team shortages in a timely manner.

- Monitoring activities solutions for the project team shortages.

- Monitoring activities for acquiring plan.

- Monitoring activities for stakeholders involvement.

- Monitoring activities for changes specification.

- Monitoring activities for the changes effect.

c. Monitoring techniques for Team management that are related to:

- Monitoring techniques includes data analysis for project team situation.

- Detection of project team problems when they occur.

- Finding suitable solutions for project team problems.

- Negotiation with stakeholders and influencing them to deal with project team issues.

- Using of project management information system.

iii. Third Section: It is about respondent recommendations about suggested improvement that can be adopted for hiring practices and project monitoring practices There are three open-ended questions that may provide important input for improvement plans.

4.4. Data Collection, Procedures and Analyses

The first type of data is the secondary data. The tool for collecting this kind of data was literature review. Hiring documents were reviewed to clarify the background, enabling environment, laws, bylaws, regulations, and instruction about hiring environment in the study's community. Also, reports related to projects were reviewed

for better understanding about project management in the Ministry of Education. The second type of data is the primary data; these are all data that were collected by the designed tool for the purpose of this research.

Further, data was collected through Google forms platform. The questionnaire was sent to each respondent of the sample. In addition, a pilot study questionnaire was sent to respondent in September 2022, and data was gathered till the end of the month. While the questionnaire was sent in the last week of October 2022, and data was gathered till the end of November 2022.

The validity of the tool. The results were extracted using two analytical programs to find the direct and indirect effects between variables. Because of the design of the study and the number of the respondents, 327 is suitable number for Smart PLS. the analytical programs were:

i.   The SPSS program Version 25.

ii.   The Smart PLS Version 4.

The analysis included descriptive Analysis of the Sample, frequencies, and percentages to identify the characteristics of the study sample and determine their responses according to personal and functional characteristics, in addition to correlation Analysis to identify the relation between the variables, regression Analysis was done to identify the level of influence of the dependent variables on the independent variable and result of Hypothesis were evaluated after all test applications.

5. Data Analysis.

It is essential to perform data screening and cleaning before the data is analyzed (DeSimone, & Harms, 2018). This step is conducted to ensure that the data can be

analyzed to accept or reject the postulated hypotheses (Pallant, 2020). DeSimone, & Harms, (2018) stated that data screening and cleaning encompass the examination of data input accuracy, and the resolution of issues related to missing values. Accordingly, no missing values were found because the tool was conducted through google forms.

5.1. Response Scale

Likert 5- degree scale was used in this study. It aimed to assess how deep practice is in application. For this purpose, Table 4.2 below is the study questionnaire scale:

Table 5-1: Study Questionnaire Scale

Response	Strongly disagree	Disagree	Moderate	Agree	Strongly agree
Degree	1	2	3	4	5
Average	1 – 1.79	1.8 – 2.59	2.6 – 3.39	3.4 – 4.19	4.2 - 5
Level	Very weak	Weak	Moderate	Strong	Very strong

After confirming the questionnaire's validity and reliability, data was collected, and analysis was done for the gathered data.

5.2. Results

In order to establish the construct validity of all the variables, the measurement model was developed. Indicator reliability tests were also performed to assess the outer loading, internal consistency (composite reliability). Convergent validity for test AVE and for the remaining items, the discriminant validity inferred a good measure. Two stages analyses was conducted for this study. first stage measuring model contains elements for six items for employment policies, five items for recruitment practices,

five items for selection practices, three dimensions for project monitoring practices and four dimensions for project team management practices. The Smart-PLS Algorithm was employed to produce the outcomes depicted. Where the second order level measurement model is depicted analyze the constructs—employment policies, recruitment practices, selection practices, and project team monitoring practices—serve as reflective indicators. Results showed that employment policies and recruitment practices have a positive relationship with project team monitoring practices, while selection practices have not. Therefore, **H1 And H2 are supported and H3 are not supported.**

6. Finding, Discussion And Recommendations

Results of regression model demonstrated that there was a significant effect of applying employment policies and recruitment practices as sub-practices of hiring on project team monitoring practices, while results showed that there was no significant effect of applying selection practices on project team monitoring practices. Consequently, results demonstrated that hiring practices can affect project monitoring practices in two of its sub practices .

General directorate of project management unit is the unit that set policies and procedures for project management practices. The director of this unit showed documents (MoE literature) related to project management practices such as projects management policies framework, projects management manual, monitoring and evaluation (M&E) framework, many M&E reports, project financing manual

Results are explainable according to MoE literature that was presented previously. MoE literature shows that minimal engagement of MoE teams to hire project teams and project monitoring team. Project team are mainly hired by the doner who is related to the project and partially by MoE, same case happens for project monitoring team.

However, hiring practices are conducted under many monitoring activities by MoE and General Personnel council, which makes the effect of hiring practices on project team monitoring explainable. While monitoring teams who are hired at projects unit at MoE are hired on job descriptions bases, their capacities are related to what is mentioned in the job description manual. Accordingly, monitoring capacities are affected by the quality of hiring practices at MoE. More and More, MoE literature of project monitoring showed that every project has a team for project monitoring who is hired by the related donor, where all project team activities are monitored by this project monitoring team. Which indicates a strong project team monitoring practice by the donor side but not by MoE side. The quality of project team monitoring practices depends on the quality of hiring practices that are done by the related donor.

However, selection practices have no significant effect on project team monitoring practices according to the results. According to the general director of human resources department, it seems that the weak role that is practiced by MoE team to select project monitoring teams and leaving the role for the donors showed this result. Since the MoE team are not participating in the selection processes, they don't pay attention to it and are not interested in seeing it as an important role to take. While employment policies implementation and recruitment practices depend heavily on MoE policies and manuals. Accordingly MoE teams (who develop and improve these documents and procedures) give more participation levels to both practices, which reflect themselves on the results.

Results can be justified by literature. The results are aligned with the previous studies. It agreed with Jahaf (2021) study findings (That was conducted in Yemen and targeted program staff at Yemen social Fund for Development with descriptive mixed

method approach (qualitative & quantitative) about the necessity to have officials who are highly skilled in M&E (Monitoring and Evaluation) to ensure effective practice of M&E. Results also aligned with Ali et al. (2021) study findings (That was conducted in Pakistan and targeted Project Managers (PM) and Associate Engineers drawn from three organization that applied qualitative research approach) about project monitoring and how can it be more prone if the monitoring staff is less experienced and not equipped with the required skills. It also agreed with Callistus and Clinton (2016) study results (That was conducted in South Africa and targeted monitoring and evaluation practitioners in nine (9) metropolitan/municipal/district assemblies that applied qualitative research approach) about the effect of the number and capacities of the selected project team on the success of any project monitoring plan, and the number and capacities of the selected project team can affect the success of any project monitoring plan. It also agreed with Nekvapilova and Pitas (2016) study results (conducted in Czech Republic and targeted project managers in both public and private services, that applied Historical research methodology) that claimed that the biggest problem threatening the success of a project is human resources, it is therefore necessary to have officials who are highly skilled in M&E to ensure effective practice of M&E. It also supported Kamau (2015) study findings (That was conducted in Kenya and targeted Kenyan public sector that applied historical research approach) about the linkage between the effectiveness of monitoring and evaluation and the strength of the project team. The same thing was mentioned by Tache and Ispasoiu (2013) study results (That targeted previous M&E literature by applying Historical research approach) about the efficiency of the use of monitoring and evaluation tools and mechanisms that can be affected by the lack of experience of the selected project team. Finally, results support PMI Iterative Approach about hiring that has main practices for project monitoring,

23

which is called project team acquisition (PMI, 2017). Consequently, study results are justified by literature that showed hiring practices effect on many project monitoring practices. Accordingly, MoE should improve hiring practices and their efficiency, which will lead to better project monitoring practices. In addition, the public policies agenda of the government, national civil service strategic plan, and strategic plan of education stress on the importance of having an efficient hiring practice.

To sum up, project team monitoring practices depend on the capacities of the project monitoring team. A team that must be hired on the basis of an acquisition plan as part of the hiring plan. The plan must include monitoring team characteristics like cost, numbers, availability time. As confirmed by literature, monitoring team acquisition practices start early in the planning process. The relation between hiring and project monitoring is confirmed by the results of this study, where hiring can affect project monitoring.

6.1. Conclusion

This study tackled hiring practices and project monitoring practices at MoE. The results showed a significant effect that two of hiring sub practices (employment policies implementation and recruitment practices) on project team monitoring practices. It also showed no significant effect of selection practices on project team monitoring practices.

7. REFERENCES

Abdul-Qadir, H., & Jaafar, Y. (2020). *The Role of Recruitment Strategy in Developing the Public Officials' Performance from The Perspective of The Ministries' Departments of The Palestine State in The Suburbs of Jerusalem*. Journal of the

Islamic University of Educational and Psychological Studies. 28 (3), 139 – 157. https://journals.iugaza.edu.ps/index.php/IUGJEB/article/view/6915

Adebayo, O., Eniowo, O., & Ogunjobi, V. (2018). Assessment of Project Monitoring and Control Techniques in Ondo State Agency for Road Maintenance and Construction (OSARMCO). International Journal of Engineering and Management Research. 8 (5), 177-184. doi.org/10.31033/ijemr.8.5.21

Al-Ghazali. S. K. (2016). The Effect of Political based Recruitment's Dimensions on The Quality of Governmental Services in Palestinian Public Ministries. (Master thesis). The Islamic University of Gaza. http://hdl.handle.net/20.500.12358/17270

Al-Jabari, M. (2013). Factors Affecting Human Resource Practices in a Sample of Diversified Palestinian Organizations. Tourism & Management Studies. 2, 594 - 603. https://www.redalyc.org/pdf/3887/388743875018.pdf

Al-Muhaimid, N. (2017). Professional Project Management According to PMI Methodology. Second edition. Riyadh, Saudi Arabia: King Fahd National Library. https://www.jarir.com/2070985-arabic-books-454090.html

Al-Naqbi, W. (2011). The Relationship Between Human Resource Practices and Employee Retention in Public Organizations: An Exploratory Study Conducted in The United Arab Emirates. (Master thesis). Edith Cowan University. https://ro.ecu.edu.au/theses

Al-Qaralah, A. (2018). The Effect of Human Resource Management Practices on Organizational Commitment in The Ministry of Education. Arab Journal for Sciences and Research Publishing. 2 (5), 1 -23. https://doi.org/10.26389/AJSRP.A120218

Al-Sabbah, M. H, Ibrahim & Shaqfa, K. (2017). HRM Practice in the Palestinian National Authority: A Literature Review. Elixir International Journal. 113, 49361-49365.https://www.academia.edu/35662873/HRM_Practice_in_the_Palestinian_National_Authority_A_Literature_Review

Al-Sawsaa, Y. (2018). The Reality of Applying Human Resource Management Functions in Public Hospitals in Benghazi City. Journal of Economic Sciences, Management and Commercial Sciences. 11 (2), 21-35. http://dspace.univ-msila.dz:8080//xmlui/handle/123456789/18734

Al-Sharbati. S. (2017). Human Resources Management Practices in the Health Sector - A Field Study on Hospitals in the South of the West Bank. (Master thesis). Hebron University. http://dspace.hebron.edu:80/xmlui/handle/123456789/627

Antoniadis, D. (2012). Complexity and the Process of Selecting Project Team Members. Journal for the Advancement of Performance Information and Value, 4(1), 1. https://doi.org/10.37265/japiv.v4i1.96

Awad, T. (2016). Determinants and Motivational Factors of Healthcare Staff: A Comparison between Governmental and Non-Governmental Hospitals in the South of West Bank / Palestine. (Master thesis). Palestine: Al-Quds University. https://dspace.alquds.edu/handle/20.500.12213/1301

Baron, J., Hannan, M., & Burton, M. (2001). Labor Pains: Change in Organizational Models and Employee Turnover in Young, High-tech Firms. American Journal of Sociology. 106 (4), 960 – 1012. https://www.researchgate.net/publication /37156100_Labor_Pains_Change_in_Organizational_Models_and_Employee_Tu rnover_in_Young_High-Tech_Firms

Bhandari, P. (2020). What Is Quantitative Research? | Definition, Uses & Methods. Reviewed date (2024/12/03). Retrieved from https:// https://www.scribbr.com/methodology/quantitative-research/Biwott, T., Egesah, O., & Ngeywo, J. (2017). Importance of Monitoring and Evaluation in the Sustainability of Constituency Development Fund (CDF) Projects in Kenya. IRA-International Journal of Management & Social Sciences (ISSN 2455-2267), 7(1), 45-51. Doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.21013/jmss.v7.n1.p6

Boskamp. E, (2022). Crucial Average Cost Per Hire Facts (2022): All Cost of Hiring Statistics. Reviewed date (2022/5/03). Retrieved from https://www.zippia.com/advice/cost-of-hiring-statistics-average-cost-per-hire/?src=sp-popout-timed.

Bothaljieh, H., & Husaini, I. (2018). Human Resources Management in the Public Sector. El - Hakika (the Truth) Journal for Social and Human Sciences. 17 (4) , 283-312.https://search-proquest- com.wwwproxy1.library.unsw.edu.au/docview /222063446/9B8EA2C296114D41PQ/2?accountid=12763

Callistus, T., & Clinton, A. (2016). Evaluating barriers to Effective Implementation of Project Monitoring and Evaluation in the Ghanaian Construction Industry. Procedia Engineering. 164, 389 – 394. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.proeng.2016.11.635

Chamberlain, A. (2019). How Long Does It Take to Hire? Interview Duration in 25 Countries. Glassdoor economic research. Retrieved from https://www.glassdoor.com/research/time-to-hire-in-25-countries/.

Coalition for Accountability and Integrity (AMAN). (2018). The National Plan to Combat Corruption in Palestine. AMAN newsletter. https://www.aman-palestine.org/reports-and-studies/8997.html

Collins, C. J., & Kehoe, R. R. (2009). The Routledge Companion to Strategic Human Resource Management. First edition. London. UK: Routledge. http://network.bepress.com/explore/business/human-resources-management/training-and-development/?q=Christopher+J.+Collins

Decenzo, D., Robbins, S., & Verhulst, S. (2016). Fundamentals of Human Resource Management. Tenth Edition. USA: John Wiley & Sons, Inc. https://books.google.ps/books?id=-V4BCgAAQBAJ&lpg=PP18&ots=dWgBxfrlLq&dq=Fundamentals%20of%20Human%20Resource%20Management&lr&hl=ar&pg=PP4#v=onepage&q=Fundamentals%20of%20Human%20Resource%20Management&f=false

DeSimone, J. A., & Harms, P. D. (2018). Dirty data: The effects of screening respondents who provide low-quality data in survey research. Journal of Business and Psychology, 33(5), 559-577.

Dessler, G. (2017). Human Resource Management. Fifteenth edition. USA: Pearson Education, Inc. https://www.pearson.com/us/higher-education/product/Dessler-Human-Resource-Management-15th-Edition/9780134235455.html

Dinsmore, P. C., & Cabanis-Brewin, J. (2010). The AMA Handbook of Project Management 3rd Edition. https://silo.pub/the-ama-handbook-of-project-management-third-edition.html

Egyankosh. (2017). Administrative Theory Collection: Max Weber's Theory of Bureaucracy. In Indira Gandhi National Open University, Administrative Theory. (pp. 2-17). https://egyankosh.ac.in/handle/123456789/25435

Gautam, L. (2022). Project Monitoring and Evaluation Practices and Project Performance: The Mediating Role of Management Support. chrome-extension://efaidnbmnnnibpcajpcglclefindmkaj/https://nepan.org.np/wp-content/uploads/2022/11/rubs_Participation-22_Prabin-Raj-Gautam.pdf

General Personnel Council of Palestine (GPC). (1998). The Palestinian Civil Services Law. <https://www.gpc.pna.ps/diwan/arabic/systemsAndLows/ >

General Personnel Council of Palestine (GPC). (2021). National Civil Service Strategic Plan. https://www.gpc.pna.ps/diwan/viewPublicReportList.gpc

General Personnel Council of Palestine (GPC). (2017). Strategic National Plan for Training of the Civil Servant Sector of Palestine 2020 - 2018. https://www.gpc.pna.ps/diwan/index.gpc

General Personnel Council of Palestine (GPC). (2020). The Civil Service Is in Numbers. https://www.gpc.pna.ps/diwan/index.gpc

General Personnel Council of Palestine (GPC). (2021). The Civil Service Is in Numbers. https://www.gpc.pna.ps/diwan/index.gpc

Gudda, P. (2011). A Guide to Project Monitoring & Evaluation. First edition. Bloomington, USA: AuthorHouse. https://www.amazon.com/Guide-Project-Monitoring-Evaluation/dp/1456784781

Hamayel. H, (2018). Administrative Problems Facing Public Secondary School Principals in Palestine. Academia Edu. 8(1). https://www.academia.edu/37860516

Hiktner, M., Shmidt, A., & Csikszentmihaly, M. (2007). Experience Sampling Methods: Measuring the Quality of Everyday Life.1st Edition. London, USA: sage publication, inc. https://psycnet.apa.org/record/2006-11885-000

Hollyer, J. R. (2012). Merit Recruitment in 19th and Early 20th Century European Bureaucracies. SSRN Electronic Journal. https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.1861469

Homayounfarda, H., & Safakishb, G. (2016). A Human Resource Evaluation Toolkit for Mega Size Industrial Projects. Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences. 226, 209-217. https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1877042816308679

Ion Chitescu, R., & Lixandru, M. (2015). The Influence of the Social, Political and Economic Effect on Human Resources, As a Determinant Factor of Sustainable Development. Procedia Economics and Finance. 39, 820-826. https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2212567116302593

Jahaf, L. (2021). The Effect of Monitoring and Evaluation Practices on Development Projects' Performance in Yemen and Its Relation to Gender. Arab Journal for Scientific Publishing (AJSP). 27. https://www.ajsp.net/research/The_Effect_Of_Monitoring_And_Evaluation_Practices_On_Development_Projects.pdf

Joostensz, T., Yuli, G., P., Ratih & Suryadi. (2015). Reformation of Bureaucracy in Personnel Recruitment to Improve Performance of Organization: A Study on Adjutant General of Indonesian Army in Bandung. Journal of Public Policy and

Administration. 5 (2), 28-38. https://www.iiste.org/Journals/index.php/ PPAR/ article/view/19746

Kaczorowska, A. (2015). Traditional and Agile Project Management in Public Sector and Ict. Computer Science and Information Systems magazine. 5, 1521–1531. https://ieeexplore.ieee.org/abstract/document/7321626

Kalayathankal, S. J., Kureethara, J. V., & Narayanamoorthy, S. (2021). A Modified Fuzzy Approach to Project Team Selection. Soft Computing Letters, 3, 100012. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socl.2021.100012

Kamau, C. (2015). Efficacy of Monitoring and Evaluation Function in Achieving Project Success in Kenya: A Conceptual Framework. Science Journal of Business and Management, 3(3), 82. https://doi.org/10.11648/j.sjbm.20150303.14

Kaushal, S. (2017). HR best practices - Transforming the thinking. Mumbai, India: Pvt Ltd. https://www.dnb.co.in/file/HR_Best_Practices_2017_Low.pdf

Kissi, E., Agyekum, K., Baiden, B., Tannor, R., Asamoah, G., & Andam, E. (2019) Impact of Project Monitoring and Evaluation Practices on Construction Project Success Criteria in Ghana. Built Environment Project and Asset Management. https://doi.org/10.1108/BEPAM-11-2018-0135

Lebow L. (2014). Identifying Best Practices in Human Resource Management. (Master thesis). Humboldt State University, Business Administration. https://scholarworks.calstate.edu/concern/theses/6t053j41m

McNeill, J. (2022). Skills Vs. Ccompetencies – What is the difference, And Why Should You Care. Reviewed date (2022/1/03). Retrieved from https://social.hays.com/2019/10/04/skills-competencies-whats-the-difference/

Nadarajah, S., Kadiresan, V., Kumar, R., Kamil, N., & Yusoff, Y. (2012). The Relationship of HR Practices and Job Performance of Academicians towards Career Development in Malaysian Private Higher Institutions. Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences. 57, 102-118. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.09.1163.

Nekvapilova, I., & Pitas, J. (2016). Factors Affecting Project Management in the Public Sector. Sciendo. 22. (1), 206-214. https://sciendo.com/article/10.1515/kbo-2016-0037

Obeid, D. (2017). The Reality of Human Resources in the Palestinian Ministries Based on the American Excellence Model and its Relationship to Performances According to the Balanced Scorecard. (Master thesis). Al Quds University. https://dspace.alquds.edu/handle/20.500.12213/3303

Oluoch, J. O. (2013). Influence of best human resource management practices on organizational performance. (Master thesis). University of Nairobi. https://profiles.uonbi.ac.ke/johnoluoch/files/research_project_final_mpp_2013_18th_july.pdf

Palestinian Ministry of Education Palestinian (PMoE). (2017). Strategic Plan for Education. /www.moe.pna.ps/uploads

Palestinian Ministry of Education. (MoE). (2019). Education Statistical Yearbook. https://moe.edu.ps/catogery/content/1214

Palestinian Ministry of Finance and Planning (PMoFP). (2000). Civil Service Ethics - A Study of The Grounds of Civil Service Ethics, Its Present State and Areas of Development.https://vm.fi/documents/10623/307711/Civil+Service+Ethics+publication+310300.pdf/

Palestinian Ministry of Finance and Planning. (MoFP). (2019). Monthly Report of The Ministry of Finance 12/2019 On Income and Expenditures For 2019.

Palestinian Ministry of National Economy. Economic Situation. Retrieved from https://www.mne.gov.ps/ministry.aspx?NewsId=2161. 27-5-2025

Pallant, J. (2020). SPSS survival manual: A step by step guide to data analysis using IBM SPSS (7th ed.). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/978100311745

Project Management Institute (PMI). (2017). A Guide to The Project Management of Body of Knowledge. Sixth Edition. Project Management Institute. https://book.akij.net/eBooks/2018/March/5abcc35b666f7/a%20guide%20to%20the%20project%20management%20body%20of%20knowledge%206e.pdf

Qashue. B. (2018). Management by Goals, or Management by Results. Signature Management & Business Magazine. Vol (trial version). Jerusalem open University. Palestine.

Sulaimani, S. (2019). Public administration in Palestine. Aarms – Academic and Applied Research in Military Science. 18 (1), 129–136.

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/336972586_Public_Administration_in_
Palestine

Tache. F and Ispasoiu. C. (2013). The Dynamic of Project Monitoring and Evaluation Mechanisms within Modern Organizations. Revista de Management Comparat Internațional. 14 (4), 628–636. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/259557229_The_Dynamic_of_Project_ Monitoring_and_Evaluation_Mechanisms_within_Modern_Organizations

Verma, R. (2016). A Comparative Study of Human Resource Management Practices in Public and Private Sector Banks. (PhD thesis). Himachal Pradesh University.

Visitchaichan, S. (2004). Revisiting Weber's Theory of Bureaucracy and its Usefulness for Analyzing Organizational Structures and Issues. Thai Journal of Public Administration, 2(2), 104–126. https://so05.tci-thaijo.org/index.php/pajournal/article/view/23227

Welasari, U. Agustino, L & Sulaeman, F (2021). Recruitment of Bureaucratic Officials for the Position of Head of the Community and Village Empowerment Agency, 2018, In the Regional Government of West Java Province, Post – Gubernatorial Election. PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt / Egyptology, 18(4), 2447-2466. https://archives.palarch.nl/index.php/jae/article/view/6674

Yaza, R., (2016). Human Resources Management in Public Administration. Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences. 9 (2), 208 – 226. https://www.asjp.cerist.dz/en/article/59176